



Planning Committee Date	18 December 2023
Report to	South Cambridgeshire District Council Planning Committee
Lead Officer	Joint Director of Planning and Economic Development
Reference	21/05643/LBC
Site	Hooks Mill Potton Road Guilden Morden
Ward / Parish	The Mordens / Guilden Morden
Proposal	Listed building consent to dismantle 3 existing curtilage listed barns and erection of 3 replacement buildings to be used as 4 units of holiday let accommodation.
Applicant	Mr & Mrs A Lewis
Presenting Officer	Mary Collins
Reason Reported to Committee	Demolition of curtilage listed buildings.
Member Site Visit Date	6 th December 2023
Key Issues	1 Impact on significance of curtilage listed buildings and setting of listed building.
Recommendation	APPROVE subject to conditions.

1.0 Executive Summary

- 1.1 This application seeks listed building consent to dismantle 3 existing curtilage listed barns and erection of 3 replacement buildings to be used as 4 units of holiday let accommodation.
- 1.2 The application has demonstrated that the removal of the curtilage listed barns is acceptable as sound justification has been put forward confirming that they are not suitable/capable of conversion.
- 1.3 The replacement buildings would preserve/enhance the setting of the listed Mill House and other listed building nearby.
- 1.4 Officers recommend that the Planning Committee Approve.

2.0 Site Description and Context

- 2.1 Hooks Mill is situated within the open countryside and located centrally between Wrestlingworth to the north, and Guilden Morden to the south. The property lies outside of the Development Framework of Guilden Morden and is not located within any Conservation Area. Extensive open fields in all directions surround the site, each of which are accessed via individual field gates.
- 2.2 The site comprises of a number of curtilage listed buildings. There is a complex of agricultural outbuildings which range from those which date back to the 18th century to more modern additions.
- 2.3 The barns which are the subject of this application are curtilage listed to 'Mill House', which is a Grade II Listed Building (Entry Number: 1128273). Mill House is an early 18th century building with 19th century and later additions. There is also Tower Mill located close by which is a mid-19th century windmill which is also grade II listed. The existing barns are the closest structures on the site in relation to Potton Road.
- 2.4 A Structural Report by Hace Consultancy, dated 4 May 2021, was submitted to provide details of the existing conditions of the barns. However, a follow up letter also from Hace Consultancy, dated 23 February 2022 advised that following the very high winds on 18 February 2022, the barns were significantly damaged and cannot be repaired, and included a recommendation that the barns are not entered and a barrier is erected with a suitable 'Dangerous Structure' notice.

3.0 The Proposal

- 3.1 Listed Building Consent is sought to dismantle the existing barns and reconstruct barn structures like for like dimensionally and in visual appearance and to use these buildings as 4 units providing Holiday Let accommodation.

4.0 SITE HISTORY

S/3482/19/FL	Provision of an outdoor horse-riding arena for private use.	Approved.
S/2101/19/LB	Retention of the Installation of new windows to existing openings re-build of SW chimney taking up and relaying flooring to kitchen pantry and scullery plastering internal walls and ceilings including addition of pargetting over range new pammments to hearth in living room and dining room new flue liner and register plate in living/dining rooms opening of fireplace in lounge new partition wall to former bathroom new partition wall in bathroom to allow bath/shower and formation of 2 no. openings to allow installation of rooflights.	Approved.
20/02426/HFUL	Single storey rear extension to replace existing single storey structure.	Approved.
20/02427/LBC	Single storey rear extension to replace existing single storey structure.	Approved.
20/02491/PRI06A	Prior notification for the erection of an agricultural building	Deemed Consent
20/02717/FUL	Construction of a 3 bay stable and tack/shoeing bay.	Approved.
21/04876/HFUL	Single storey rear extension to replace existing single storey structure. Resubmission of 20/02426/HFUL.	Approved.
21/04877/LBC	Single storey rear extension to replace existing single storey structure. Resubmission of 20/02427/LBC.	Approved.
21/05642/FUL	Demolition of 3 existing curtilage listed barns and erection of 3 replacement buildings to be used as 4 units of holiday let accommodation.	Pending

5.0 POLICY

5.1 National Guidance

National Planning Policy Framework 2023 (NPPF)
National Planning Practice Guidance (NPPG)
National Design Guide (NDG)

5.2 South Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2018

S/3: Presumption in Favour of Sustainable Development
NH/14: Heritage Assets

5.3 South Cambridgeshire Supplementary Planning Documents (SPD)

Listed Buildings SPD- Adopted July 2009

6.0 CONSULTATIONS

6.1 Guilden Morden Parish Council - Support the application.

6.2 Conservation Officer – No Objection

6.3 1st Comment (17 February 2022):

There was a pre-application submission for similar works and the response asked for additional information to be submitted with any application including a structural engineer's report on the barns. It is acknowledged that the barns are now proposed to be demolished rather than repaired, but a report should still be submitted to show that the curtilage listed barns are not suitable for repair.

6.4 The proposal for the permanent bridge and access road is not supported due to the impact on the setting of the mill and mill house.

6.5 The proposed car parking spaces at the end of the access to the site could be supported as they would be kept away from the setting of the mill. It is not clear if there is a disabled parking bay by the holiday lets which it is understood would be required? If this is the case, this should be shown on the proposed site plan.

6.6 Provided that the structural survey shows that the barns are beyond reasonable repair, the existing materials should be salvaged and re-used where possible.

6.7 Barn 3 has a considerably bigger roof than the existing barn, with a large number of rooflights. Justification for this has not been provided. Barn 2 is showing a flue on the south elevation, but not on the others. This is not supported as it is too domestic for agricultural outbuildings. The fully glazed lights on the south of barn 1 are not supported as they detract from the outbuilding character. Where fully glazed French doors are proposed, these need to be reconsidered to something more appropriate to a curtilage listed agricultural outbuilding.

6.8 2nd Comments (20 May 2022):

The structural report and a photographic survey have now been submitted. The structural survey shows that the coverings of the timber framework of the barns are beyond reasonable repair. The frames should remain in place as per the report and the existing cladding materials should be salvaged and re-used where possible.

- 6.9 The applicant has not submitted any revised plans to address the issues raised in the previous Conservation comments regarding the proposed design of the barns. Those concerns remain.
- 6.10 3rd Comments (25 November 2022):
The proposals have now removed the proposed temporary bridge for the construction of the holiday accommodation which is supported. However, the proposed plans have not been amended or the points raised fully discussed as per my previous comments regarding the design (20.05.22).
- 6.11 The agent's comments on the roof of Barn 3 are noted as is the removal of the proposed flue. The justification for the rooflights is noted and agreed. However there has been no reference to the fully glazed lights on elevation 9 or the French doors on elevations 7, 15 and 12. These very domestic features need to be reconsidered either with pinned back timber doors/covers or they should be only partially glazed so that they have a more agricultural character.
- 6.12 Also as mentioned previously, if there is to be any landscaping to the scheme other than the site boundary, this should be submitted for written agreement.
- 6.13 4th Comments (15 December 2022):
No objection. The revised drawings have included 'pinned back' timber doors to the French doors on elevations 7, 12 and 15, and louvres over the fixed lights adjacent to the timber doors on elevation 9. These new proposals have given the buildings a more agricultural character, balancing the very modern domestic character, and the applications can now be supported. The buildings are now more appropriate to their curtilage listed status and the setting of the listed building.
- 6.14 A pre-commencement condition is requested in relation to construction details and materials.
- 6.15 5th Comments (2 November 2023):
Revised plans show that the cycle store is proposed to be in a separate outbuilding. This is acceptable as being an appropriate building within the site of this listed building. The elevation drawings of the barns are as seen before and previously agreed in Conservation terms.
- 6.16 **Historic England - No objection.**
- 6.17 The above responses are a summary of the comments that have been received. Full details of the consultation responses can be inspected on the application file.

7.0 OTHER REPRESENTATIONS

- 7.1 None

8.0 ASSESSMENT

8.1 Principle of Development - Impact on the curtilage listed buildings.

- 8.2 The application falls with the setting of the grade 2 listed Mill House an early 18th century building with 19th century and later additions and Hooks Mill and Engine House, a water mill dated 18th century and 19th century engine house. Adjacent to the barns and circa 6 metres to the north-east of Mill House is a late 19th century cast iron pump with spout and lever, situated over a well which is listed. There is also Tower Mill very close by which is a mid-19th century windmill also grade II listed. All these buildings were listed in 1986.
- 8.3 The barns which are the subject of this application are curtilage listed to 'Mill House', which is a Grade II Listed Building (Entry Number: 1128273). The existing barns are the closest structures on the site in relation to Potton Road
- 8.4 Section 66 of the Planning (LBCA) Act 1990 states that in considering whether to grant planning permission for development which affects a listed building or its setting, the local planning authority shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses.
- 8.5 Paragraph 194 of the National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF) states that Local Planning Authorities should require an applicant to describe the significance of any heritage assets affected, including any contribution made by their setting. The level of detail should be proportionate to the assets' importance and no more than is sufficient to understand the potential impact of the proposal on their significance. As a minimum the relevant historic environment record should have been consulted and the heritage assets assessed using appropriate expertise where necessary.
- 8.6 Paragraph 195 states that LPAs should identify and assess the particular significance of any heritage asset that may be affected by a proposal (including by development affecting the setting of a heritage asset) taking account of the available evidence and any necessary expertise. They should take this into account when considering the impact of a proposal on a heritage asset, to avoid or minimise any conflict between the heritage asset's conservation and any aspect of the proposal.
- 8.7 Paragraph 197 states that in determining applications, local planning authorities should take account of:
- (a) the desirability of sustaining and enhancing the significance of heritage assets and putting them to viable uses consistent with their conservation;
 - (b) the positive contribution that conservation of heritage assets can make to sustainable communities including their economic vitality; and

(c) the desirability of new development making a positive contribution to local character and distinctiveness.

- 8.8 Paragraph 199 of the NPPF states that when considering the impact of a designated heritage asset great weight should be given to the asset's conservation. The more important the asset, the greater the weight should be.
- 8.9 Paragraph 200 states that any harm to, loss of, the significance of the designated heritage assets should require clear and convincing justification.
- 8.10 Paragraph 202 of the NPPF states that where a development proposal will lead to less than substantial harm to the significance of a designated heritage asset, this harm should be weighed against the public benefits of the proposal including, where appropriate, securing its optimum viable use.
- 8.11 Local Plan policies HQ/1 and NH/14 align with the statutory provisions and NPPF advice. Policy NH/14 of the Local Plan requires that developments sustain and enhance the special character and distinctiveness of the districts historic environment and create new high-quality significance of heritage assets, including their settings.
- 8.12 Unless the list entry explicitly says otherwise, the law (section 1(5) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990) says that the listed building also includes any ancillary object or structure within the curtilage of the building that forms part of the land and has done so since before 1st July 1948. Whether land comes within the curtilage of a building depends on the facts and the nature for which the land has been held and used.
- 8.13 In this case, the buildings are considered to be curtilage listed. An understanding of whether they are protected in principle and what special interest they hold, on their own or together with the principal building is required. If they hold no special interest, even if within the curtilage, works to them and even their demolition will not require listed building consent as this is only required for works that affect the character of a building listed as a building of special architectural or historic interest.
- 8.14 All of the buildings share the same design principles. A low-level solid brick wall, supporting a timber post and rail type structure with a "cut" timber roof comprising main cut trusses, purlins and an array of timber rafters. There is also the occasional timber tie/collar and timber frame. The floor slabs albeit that they vary in condition, comprise an independent concrete slab foundation which may have been in-fill. It is suspected the existing foundations to be minimal.
- 8.15 The buildings themselves are considered of minor significance in terms of architectural and historic interest. Their main significance and special interest being derived from the contribution they make to the rural setting and wider landscape of the listed Mill House and its associated mill leat and the listed adjacent Tower Mill.

- 8.16 All of the barns have some form of partial collapse or loss of roofing/timber cladding and are therefore, quite vulnerable to the elements.
- 8.17 The proposal would entail the loss of the existing curtilage listed barns. With reference to the NPPF and the effect on the significance of the heritage asset, paragraphs 197 and 199 would apply. It is considered that the proposals would cause less than substantial harm to the character and significance of the listed building. Any harm to, or loss of, the significance of a designated heritage asset (from its alteration or destruction, or from development within its setting), requires clear and convincing justification in accordance with paragraph 200 of the NPPF. Paragraph 202 of the NPPF requires that the identified harm should be weighed against the public benefits of the proposal.
- 8.18 The principle of dismantling the barns is acceptable subject to sound justification for the loss of the buildings and for their replacement preserving or enhancing the setting of the listed building(s).
- 8.19 The applicants have submitted a structural engineer's report on the barns and their capability of being converted. Given their simple construction and possible lack of foundations, it is considered that they are not suited to conversion. The report does not consider retention of use for agricultural purposes but the buildings are historic farm building which have fallen out of use. Following the very high winds on Friday 18th February 2022, the structural engineers have confirmed that the barns have been so damaged that they cannot be repaired and are unstable.
- 8.20 The new barn structures would have the same dimensions as the existing barns. The buildings would have a similar visual appearance and would retain an agricultural character, which would outweigh the residential character introduced by the new use. The reconstructed buildings are appropriate to their curtilage listed status and the setting of the listed building.
- 8.21 The harm through the demolition of these curtilage listed buildings would be outweighed by the benefits that the replacement buildings would make to the setting of the heritage assets. It is considered that the proposal, by virtue of its scale, massing and design, would not harm the character or the setting of the nearby listed buildings. The proposal would not give rise to any harmful impact on the identified heritage assets and is compliant with the provisions of the Planning (Listed Building and Conservation Areas) Act 1990, the NPPF and Local Plan policy NH/14.

9.0 Conclusion / Planning Balance

- 9.1 Planning decisions must be taken in accordance with the development plan unless there are material considerations that indicate otherwise (section 70(2) of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 and section 38[6] of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004).
- 9.2 Summary of benefits

- The replacement buildings would preserve the setting of nearby Grade II listed buildings.
- The replacement buildings predominately have an agricultural character and their scale and appearance is of a high quality.
- Contribution to local economy through provision of visitor accommodation.

9.3 Summary of harm

- Loss of historic fabric and curtilage listed buildings.

9.4 Having taken into account the provisions of the development plan, NPPF and NPPG guidance, the statutory requirements of section 66(1) of the Town and Country Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990, the views of statutory consultees and wider stakeholders, as well as all other material planning considerations, the proposed development is recommended for approval.

10.0 RECOMMENDATION

10.1 Approve subject to:

-The planning conditions as set out below with minor amendments to the conditions as drafted delegated to officers.

11 CONDITIONS

- 1 The works hereby permitted shall be begun before the expiration of three years from the date of this consent.

Reason: To comply with the requirements of Section 18 of the Planning (Listed Building & Conservation Areas) Act 1990 (as amended by Section 51 of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004).

- 2 The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the approved plans as listed on this decision notice.

Reason: In the interests of good planning, for the avoidance of doubt and to facilitate any future application to the Local Planning Authority under Section 19 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990.

- 3 No work shall commence on construction of the new holiday lets, until details of the following items have been submitted for the prior, written approval of the Local Planning Authority:
 - (a) Samples of all materials to be provided on site
 - (b) Details of the windows and doors including the glazing
 - (c) Details of the rooflights
 - (d) Details of any materials/structural elements to be reused.

The works shall be carried out in accordance with the agreed details and retained as such thereafter.

Reason: To avoid harm to the special interest of the listed building in accordance with policy NH/14 of the South Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2018.

Background Papers:

The following list contains links to the documents on the Council's website and / or an indication as to where hard copies can be inspected.

- South Cambridgeshire Local Plan 2018
- South Cambridgeshire Local Development Framework SPDs